



SMITHFIELD CITY PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES December 18, 2019

The Planning Commission of Smithfield City met in the City Council Chambers
96 South Main, Smithfield, Utah at 6:30 p.m. on Wednesday, December 18, 2019

The following members were present constituting a quorum:

Chairman: Andrew Soelberg

Members: Kelly Luthi
Jackie Hancock
Jasilyn Heaps
Scott Gibbons
Nathan Wright

Excused: Casey McCammon
Hutch Daniels
Greg Gardner

City Planner: Shari Phippen

City Councilmember: Curtis Wall

Attendance: Sally Karren, Roger L. Karren, Lori Karren, Hollee Krusi, John Krusi, Jon Wells, Glade Smith, Bryce Goodin, Matt Hyde, Don Barringer, Alisa Staley, Judy Mitton, Darcy Damstedt, David Damstedt, Charles Bartlett, John Bruins, Paul Hancock, Ursula Jaussi, Kyle Jaussi, Mayor Jeffrey Barnes, Chad Brown, Debbie Zilles, Katie Bell

6:30 P.M. Meeting called to order by Chairman Soelberg.

Commissioner Hancock was joined by her grandchildren, Lily and Jackson Wilson, who led the Pledge of Allegiance. Chairman Soelberg thanked Commissioner Hancock for her many years of service on the Planning Commission. Councilmember Wall noted that she will be recognized at the January City Council meeting.

Consideration of consent agenda and approval of meeting minutes:

After consideration by the Commission, Chairman Soelberg declared the meeting agenda and the minutes from the November 20, 2019 meeting to stand as submitted.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None

AGENDA ITEMS:

PUBLIC HEARING to receive comment concerning a proposal to rezone Parcel 08-070-0067, located at 248 East Center, from Residential R-1-10 to Residential Multi-Family (Applicant: Jay B. Karren Family)

6:35 P.M. Public Hearing Opened

Charles Bartlett has lived adjacent to this property since 1981. He understands what the Karren family is doing, but is concerned about the beautiful view from his backyard and how a multi-family development would impact the area.

John Bruins has lived in this area since 2004 and is good friends with the Karren family. He is concerned with the potential impact to property values. Ms. Phippen confirmed for him that the Karren family is the applicant of this request. Mr. Bruins does not know what the developer has in mind, but is worried about this becoming a low-rent complex.

Lori Karren has been helping her parents (who own the 7-bedroom, 4,000 SF home on the 1-acre property) downsize and clean up the property for the last few years. She explained that the intention is to make it a respectable area, she grew up there and wants it to remain a wonderful place as the City grows.

Roger Karren said the size of the land can make it easy to collect clutter and he is worried about it becoming another junkyard if it remains as is. It is in the center of town and they are sensitive to the concerns of the neighbors. They do not want to see property values decrease in any way. He thinks this will help improve the block.

6:45 P.M. Public Hearing Closed

Discussion and consideration of a proposal to rezone Parcel 08-070-0067, located at 248 East Center, from Residential R-1-10 to Residential Multi-Family.

Chairman Soelberg pointed out that a rezone to Residential Multi-Family would not be out of compliance with the General Plan, provided that the overall density does not exceed that which is anticipated by the Medium Density Residential provisions.

MOTION: Motion made by Commissioner Heaps to forward a recommendation to the City Council to **approve** a rezone of Parcel 08-070-0067, located at 248 East Center, from Residential R-1-10 to Residential Multi-Family. Commissioner Hancock seconded the motion. Motion approved unanimously (6-0).

Vote

Aye: Luthi, Hancock, Heaps, Soelberg, Gibbons, Wright

PUBLIC HEARING to receive comment concerning a proposal to rezone Parcel 08-044-0006, located at approximately 755 North Main from Agricultural to Residential Multi-Family. (Applicant: Matt Hyde)

6:48 P.M. Public Hearing Opened

John Krusi encouraged the Commission to consider leaving the property Agricultural as there is plenty of housing in the area.

Hollee Krusi lives on Oak Street and is concerned about the increase of traffic, especially in their neighborhood and access onto the highway, which is already difficult, and may increase congestion.

Chad Brown agrees with the concerns expressed and is also worried about additional traffic, especially the safety aspect as there are many children in the area. Oak Street is a quaint, quiet area, which is part of the enjoyment of living there. Putting in apartments will not be conducive to the type of environment that is there, which is why they bought their home 16 years ago.

Judy Mitton suggested something more appealing than multi-family housing since this is the entrance to the City from the north. Over time, multi-family developments can degenerate and this may not be how Smithfield would like to welcome people to the City.

Matt Hyde has owned the property for over three years and has considered different options. He assured residents that there will be no access, or connection to, Oak Street. UDOT has granted highway access from this property; they own the property on the edge of the highway, and can create a transition area if they find it to be necessary.

Alisa Staley is concerned with more traffic entering/exiting the highway at the high rate of speed. Preston is growing and traffic congestion will continue to be a problem.

6:57 P.M. Public Hearing Closed

Discussion and consideration of a proposal to rezone Parcel 08-044-0006, located at approximately 755 North Main from Agricultural to Residential Multi-Family.

Matt Hyde has been a resident of Smithfield for over 40 years, he takes pride in the City and wants to improve this property. Having nice townhomes there would look better than the current condition of the parcel. This property is quite unique, the northeast portion, around the Questar fence, is useless property and they have discussed having a City entrance sign placed there. The property has only one access off the highway, so there will only be a 500' dead end allowed. The power lines on the north and south side of the property have 50' of easements, so there will be no buildings located there. Having this rezoned to Multi-Family is the best use of the property because it will have plenty of open/green space; backyards will be 60+'. He has owned the property for the past three years and has had no interest in any commercial development due to the limitations of the property.

Chairman Soelberg asked about the 50' power line easement measurement; Ms. Phippen said it is measured from the edge of the property line. She noted that that the power lines significantly impact the density of what is available, regardless of the zone.

Commissioner Luthi asked why the Future Land Use Map shows this property as Agricultural. Ms. Phippen said she believes it was just an oversight. Chairman Soelberg said with the power lines the Commission may not have considered it. Councilmember Wall said there was some discussion about possible storage units and light commercial, but careful consideration has been given with regards to what would be appropriate to put in at this location.

Ms. Phippen confirmed for Commissioner Luthi that this is south of the Gateway area.

MOTION: Motion made by Commissioner Luthi to forward a recommendation to the City Council to **approve** a rezone of Parcel 08-044-0006, located at approximately 755 North Main from Agricultural to Residential Multi-Family. Commissioner Wright seconded the motion. Motion approved unanimously (6-0).

Vote

Aye: Luthi, Hancock, Heaps, Soelberg, Gibbons, Wright

Discussion and consideration of a preliminary plat for Fox Meadows 2, a 26-lot subdivision located approximately 325 North 600 West (Applicant: VHD, LLC)

Bryce Goodin explained that this is the second phase of the subdivision development. The lots will be the same type as in Phase 1. There will be a lift station put in on the northwest portion of the property (north of proposed lot 12). There is discussion about a regional lift station on the west side of town, however, this lift will be put in as a temporary one until the regional one is completed. This phase and future phases will feed into this temporary station; Phase 1 feeds into the City gravity system. There will be an 8" line put in with a pressurized main that is being designed to use with the future regional station.

Ms. Phippen pointed out that this makes a beneficial connection to 800 West that will help pull traffic out of the existing neighborhood and reduce traffic on Saddleback Road.

MOTION: Motion made by Commissioner Luthi to forward a recommendation to the City Council to **approve** a preliminary plat for Fox Meadows 2, a 26-lot subdivision located approximately 325 North 600 West. Commissioner Hancock seconded the motion. Motion approved unanimously (6-0).

Vote

Aye: Luthi, Hancock, Heaps, Soelberg, Gibbons, Wright

Discussion and consideration of a preliminary plat for Fairway Ridge Subdivision, an 8-lot subdivision located at approximately 700 East 300 South. (Applicant: VHD, LLC)

Commissioner Gibbons asked if there was a reason the entrance was not designed to tie in with the existing 3-way stop on 700 East and make it a 4-way stop. Mr. Goodin said a few different designs were considered. Carrying 700 North further north through the property did not seem to make sense with regards to connectivity with the parcels to the west. They did not want to go in at 700 East and have to do a horseshoe loop, or to have two connections. There was an option that included a hammerhead, but that was not a good design for the size that would have been required. This seems to be the best design for this parcel. Ms. Phippen pointed out that the offset is enough that it will not cause any issues with the current 3-way stop.

Commissioner Gibbons asked if lots 1-4 would access the interior road (250 South) and not onto 700 East. Mr. Goodin confirmed that is how they are being designed; Ms. Phippen said that will be recorded on the plat so that it will show on the deeds.

MOTION: Motion made by Commissioner Wright to forward a recommendation to the City Council to **approve** a preliminary plat for Fairway Ridge Subdivision, an 8-lot subdivision located at approximately 700 East 300 South with the condition that lots 1-4 access only onto 250 South. Commissioner Heaps seconded the motion. Motion approved unanimously (6-0).

Vote

Aye: Luthi, Hancock, Heaps, Soelberg, Gibbons, Wright

Discussion and consideration of a final plat for Smithfield Meadows, a 7-lot subdivision located at 75 West 400 North. (Applicant: Bryce Goodin)

Ms. Phippen pointed out that the existing home is located on lot 6, this subdivision will add six new homes on the property. The developer has the option of accessing lots 1-3 either from 100 West, across the canal, or via an easement across lot 7, which is still being worked out. If the choice is to access those lots via an easement, the developer will be required to provide the City with drawings outlining how the easement will be built/maintained prior to receiving zoning clearance for construction of any homes on lots 1-3. They have a meeting with the canal company next month. The developer is not required to have the access finalized prior to receiving final plat approval.

Chairman Soelberg asked about the configuration of lot 4. Mr. Goodin confirmed it is because of the of the small piece the irrigation company owns on the southwest corner.

Mr. Goodin clarified for Commissioner Wright that because the roads are already built out, the storm water has already been accounted for; no additional impervious surfaces are being added.

MOTION: Motion made by Commissioner Heaps to forward a recommendation to the City Council to **approve** a final plat for Smithfield Meadows, a 7-lot subdivision located at 75 West 400 North. Commissioner Hancock seconded the motion. Motion approved unanimously (6-0).

Vote

Aye: Luthi, Hancock, Heaps, Soelberg, Gibbons, Wright

PUBLIC HEARING to receive comment concerning Ordinance 19-18: An Ordinance amending Animal Land Use in Smithfield City.

7:30 P.M. Public Hearing Opened

7:31 P.M. Public Hearing Closed

Discussion and consideration of Ordinance 19-18: An Ordinance amending Animal Land Use in Smithfield City

Ms. Phippen said one resident comment was received requesting that “bull” be added to the chart under the Cattle category. The Commission agreed.

Chairman Soelberg received a comment about the odor of Billy goats. Ms. Phippen said that is the reason they have a higher point value requiring a larger property (and they are not allowed in subdivisions). Commissioner Gibbons said turkeys have a similar concern. Ms. Phippen said most of these will be self-limiting.

Chairman Soelberg asked about the possibility of combining properties to allow for a higher animal point value. Ms. Phippen said that is not included in this ordinance.

MOTION: Motion made by Commissioner Luthi to forward a recommendation to the City Council to **approve** Ordinance 19-18: An Ordinance amending Animal Land Use in Smithfield City as presented and discussed. Commissioner Hancock seconded the motion. Motion approved unanimously (6-0).

Vote

Aye: Luthi, Hancock, Heaps, Soelberg, Gibbons, Wright

Discussion and consideration of Ordinance 19-15: An Ordinance establishing a Master Planned Community Zone and establishing the regulations therein.

Ms. Phippen said the comment about dropping single-family detached housing down to 20-30% is much too low (page 4). She can understand dropping it from 60% to 50% but no lower. Commissioner Wright agreed and said the intent is to allow for smaller lots, not more multi-family. This is a single-family ordinance that allows for a variety of housing types. He recommended keeping the requirement at 60%. Commissioner Gibbons said the intent of this ordinance is to give developers an option for smaller lots. He does not like the current trend of stacking apartments and townhomes in one location. This idea is to create a zone which allows for varied housing types, but with more emphasis on single-family homes on smaller lots.

Commissioner Heaps asked if there would be smaller setbacks on smaller lots. Ms. Phippen explained that one of the biggest reasons for large front setbacks is to accommodate large vehicles (not allowing vehicles to hang out over the public right-of-way). Building trends have been to put garages on the front of homes, therefore, front setbacks were increased. One suggestion is allowing a smaller front setback on projects with alley-loaded garages. Commissioner Gibbons suggested defining setbacks for both front and rear-loaded garages. Ms. Phippen said she will reduce the primary structure setback for alley-loaded or detached garages or if the garage is recessed behind a minimum of 10'. A house can be pushed forward, however the 25' setback of the garage should be maintained.

Commissioner Gibbons questioned if this would have any impacts on the percentages and/or bonuses and whether developers will use this ordinance if there are too many restrictions in place. Commissioner Wright said the current net acreage definition reads

Commissioner Wright asked why single-family attached and multi-family parking requirements are different and why it is not based on the number of bedrooms. Ms. Phippen said it is a distinction without a difference. Commissioner Wright said garages should not be counted any different from parking spaces. Chairman Soelberg said it adds to the aesthetics, generally garages are more visually pleasing than covered parking. Ms. Phippen suggested (in section Q. Parking 1) striking “~~In addition to any garage parking provided by the developer~~” and having it read “Each dwelling unit shall be required to have the following off-street parking spaces”. Commissioner Wright said as far as number of units, a garage makes no difference, often small garages become storage units, which could actually reduce available parking. Ms. Phippen said a certain amount of parking will be required, a developer can determine how that will be accomplished. Ms. Phippen suggested simplifying it by requiring one space per bedroom. She also suggested changing wording in Section Q 3.4 to read “*In no case shall more than twenty parking stalls be grouped together*”.

Commissioner Wright noted that in §17.81.070.C, requiring 50’ for a private alley with no sidewalks seems excessive. Ms. Phippen can understand reducing the widths of alleys that serve only to access garages; she recommended that the right-of-way for alleys used solely for accessing garages shall not be constructed to less than 26’ and in no case, shall any public utilities be located within an alley with an exception that can be made for storm drain lines at the discretion and approval of Smithfield City.

Regarding trails/bicycle circulation, Chairman Soelberg recommended possibly increasing the bonus to 3% if the trails connect to an existing trail network, or which are part of the City/County Trails Master Plan. Ms. Phippen recommended changing “gross project size” to linear feet.

Ms. Phippen will do more research on Recreational Facilities bonus for the next meeting discussion.

Ms. Phippen said, in reference to Councilmember Hunsaker’s comment from the last meeting regarding requiring HOAs, that an HOA is an entirely private contract between the developer and the residents of a project and the City should not be involved. When the City starts requiring HOAs or reviewing CCRs, there is an assumption of liability or enforcement that the City should not take on.

Ms. Phippen will have legal counsel review this ordinance.

Ms. Phippen said one suggestion was to add in graphics and drawings to help illustrate some items such as setbacks.

Chairman Soelberg suggested changing §17.81.050 G Lot Widths/Setbacks to “*Single-family attached and multi-family housing lot widths shall be measured at the point where the structure meets the open space.*” Ms. Phippen will make the changes to this section chart to reflect the changes discussed.

Commissioner Wright asked if the Net Acreage on the Base Density should be 4.5 rather than 6. Ms. Phippen will do some research on this for the next meeting.

Chairman Soelberg advised that discussion of this item will continue to the January 15, 2020 meeting.

Discussion and Adoption of the 2020 Smithfield City Planning Commission Meeting Schedule.

The 2020 Smithfield City Planning Commission will meet on the third Wednesday of each month. Unless specifically noted, all meetings will begin at 6:30 p.m. and will be held at the Smithfield City Hall Council Chambers located at 96 South Main, Smithfield, Utah.

2020 Meeting Dates
January 15
February 19
March 18
April 15
May 20
June 17
July 15
August 19
September 16
October 21
November 18
December 16

The Planning Commission adopted the dates as presented.

STAFF REPORT

Ms. Phippen said some upcoming items will be updating the land use matrix and refining the subdivision approval process. She has had some calls from developers who want to have a public forum for residents and the City to provide input on projects. She advised that those type of meetings can be held privately between the developer and residents; the City will become involved when an application is submitted.

MEETING ADJOURNED at 8:57 P.M.

Minutes submitted by Debbie Zilles

Andrew Soelberg, Chairperson